To Accreditation Council Of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality assurance In Higher education and health care May 14, 2021

# REPORT

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7M10108 "MANAGEMENT IN PUBLIC HEALTH CARE" PROFILE DIRECTION OF THE NJSC "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (MASTER'S DEGREE SPECIALTIES) IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATION

period of external expert evaluation: 12.05.-14.05.2021

Karaganda, 2021

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	EEC composition	4
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	7
2.1	Representation of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" and Master's degree programme 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction	7
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Self-assessment report analysis Master's educational programme 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction	7
2.4	General assessment of the educational programme 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes of magistracy of medical educational institutions	8
3.	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	9
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the master's educational program 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	15
5.	Recommendations for improvement educational programme magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	22
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	22
7.	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the Master's degree programme 7M10108 "Management in Public health care" profile direction for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards	24
8.	Attachment 2. List of documents requested by EEC members in the framework of specialized accreditation	25

# CONTENT

# LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

AD	Administrative department		
HEI	Higher educational institution		
SAC	State Attestation Commission		
SCES	State Compulsory Education Standard		
DPE	Department of Postgraduate Education		
DSD&QMS	Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management System		
DE&F	Department of Economics and Finance		
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher		
	Education and Health care		
KMU "KSPH"	Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"		
СТ	Comprehensive testing		
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines		
CE	Comprehensive exam		
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan		
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan		
EMC	Educational and Methodological Council		
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education		
PHC	Public health care		
RDMT	Registration and defense of a master's thesis		
RC	Required component		
Faculty	Faculty		
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan		
Media	Media		
TC	Typical curricula		
AC	Academic Council		
EDS	Electronic digital signature		
CBL	Challenge Based Learning		
GPA	Grade Point Average		
MBA	Master of Business Administration		
PhD	Philosophy Doctor		
TBL	Team Based Learning		
	Problem Based Learning		

COMPOSITION OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care for external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation of Non-profit joint stock company "Medical University of Karaganda"

Dates of visit: May 12-14, 2021



Chairperson of the External Expert Commission

ERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Public health care NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov " Tel .: +77022330465, e-mail:<u>aleka\_2807@mail.ru</u>



**Foreign expert (online)** 

SULAEVA OKSANA, PhD, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Secretary General of the Organization of PhD Education in Biomedical Sciences in the European Education System (ORPHEUS), Head of the Pathology Department of the Ukrainian Endocrinological Surgical Center for Research and Practice, Kiev, Republic of Ukraine. In 2012-2014. Director of PhD programmes at Donetsk

National Medical University, Member of the European Society of Pathologists, Member of the Inflammation Research Network of Canada.

tel .: +38 099 3809417 e-mail: oksana.sulaieva@gmail.com



# National academic expert

URAZOVA SALTANAT NURGOZHAEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No. 3 NJSC "Astana Medical University" tel .: +77752248377, e-mail:saltanat.uraz@mail.ru



# National academic expert

KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department clinical specialties of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, leading researcher of JSC "Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology", Almaty Tel .:87058112598,e-mail: <u>zulfiya-zhankalo@mail.ru</u>



# National academic expert

ZHAKYPBEKOV KAYRAT SAPARKHANOVICH, PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Organization, Administration and Economics of Pharmacy and Clinical Pharmacy of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU Tel. +77479224950, e-mail: <u>kairat\_phd@mail.ru</u>



Expert - employers' representative VITT SVETLANA VLADIMIROVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Deputy Director for Medical Work of LLP "City Center of Primary Health Care Karaganda" tel .: + 7 7013579954, e-mail: <u>svvitt@mail.ru</u>



# **Expert - resident representative (online)** SHAIKHINA DINARA,

1-year resident doctor in the specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including children's" NUO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" tel. + 7777 8189904, e-mail:danara 1107@mail.ru



**Expert - student representative** ISKAKOVA SALTANAT MUKTAROVNA, 2nd year student in the specialty "Pharmacy" of the Private Institution Academy "Bolashaq" tel .: +7 701 2165065, e-mail:<u>balken\_1974@mail.ru</u>



# ECAQA Observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department Of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care tel .: +7 747 5609212, e-mail:<u>info@ecaqa.org</u>

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

# 2.1 Presentation of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" and educational programme of magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction

Non-profit joint stock company "Medical University of Karaganda" (hereinafter - NJSC "MUK") was established in 1950 on the basis of the Resolution of the Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR No. 65 dated January 20, 1950 "On the organization of the Karaganda State Medical Institute" in accordance with the order of the Council of Ministers of the Union SSR of December 5, 1949 No. 19630-p. NJSC "MUK" is the leading medical university in Kazakhstan for the training of qualified personnel for the health care system, has a high reputation in the provision of educational, scientific and medical diagnostic services, has a high national rating among medical universities in Kazakhstan.

Currently, the university implements multilevel training of specialists: technical and vocational education (TVE), bachelor's, postgraduate (master's, doctoral, residency,) and additional education. Training is carried out in the state, Russian and English languages. The university teaches 8 undergraduate programmes, 13 graduate programmes, 5 doctoral programmes and 30 residency programmes. In addition, additional training is offered for health and education workers in 52 specialties.

The organizational structure of the university includes 7 schools (medicine, dentistry, public health care and biomedicine, pharmacy, nursing education, science, residency and professional development), the International Faculty of Medicine, the Center for Physical Health, the Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies (hereinafter - the Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies) and 15 departments ...

NJSC "MUK" is included in the Directory of medical schools "Avicenna" of the World Health Organization and the World Federation of Medical Education. NJSC "MUK" is a member of the Magna Carta of Universities (MCU), the Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), the Association for the Study of Medical Education (ASME), the Association for Medical Education of Asia (AMEA), the Organization for the Defense of PhD in Biomedicine and Health care in the European system (ORPHEUS), Organization for University Mobility in Asia and the Pacific (UMAP), International Association for Development of Educational (IADE), European University Association (EUA).

NJSC "MUK" is the first medical university of the Republic of Kazakhstan that successfully passed the certification of the quality management system in 2005 for compliance of educational, scientific and clinical activities with the requirements of the International ISO 9001 standard by the certification body NQA - UK (Great Britain), NQA - Russia. In 2015, he was certified by the certification body SGS (Switzerland). In 2016, he was accredited in the field of healthcare for compliance with the accreditation standards for medical organizations providing inpatient care with the assignment of the first category.

In 2019, NJSC "MUK" passed the re-institutional accreditation of the university (IAAR), also in 2019, the institutional accreditation of additional education and the TVE level (IAAR) was passed.

NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" is the first medical university of the Republic of Kazakhstan that successfully passed in 2005 the certification of the quality management system of the university of educational, scientific and clinical activities for compliance with the requirements of the International Standard ISO 9001 by the certification body NQA - UK (Great Britain), NQA - Russia. In 2015 he was certified by SGS (Switzerland), in 2020 he was recertified by the Certification Association "Russian Register" (Russia).

The educational programme (hereinafter - EP) of the magistracy 7M10108 - "Management in public health care" was developed in accordance with the State Compulsory Education Standard of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, order No. 604 dated October 31, 2018. on the approval of the State Educational Standard of all levels of education.

EP of magistracy 7M10108 - "Management in public health care" and its Mission was discussed at the meeting of the Academic Council of NJSC "MUK" on 25.04.2019, protocol No. 9. Approved by the Chairperson of the Board - Rector of NJSC "MUK" on 25.04.2019.

EP of magistracy 7M10108 - "Management in public health care" posted on University Internet

resource and is available to potential undergraduates and employers.

In 2019, the educational master's programme 7M10108 - "Management in Public health care" was included in the register <u>Unified management system for higher education of the Ministry of</u> Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan...

## 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Until now accreditation for the programme of magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care "profile direction was not carried out.

# 2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction

Self-assessment report educational programme presented on 142 pages of the main text, annexes from 16 tables and copies or electronic versions of documents on the organization of education, located at the link <u>www.qmu.kz...</u>

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of the information provided by the accredited NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda". Attached to the report is a cover letter signed by the rector, MD, professor Dosmagambetova Raushan Sultanovna, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", who is responsible for the self-assessment of the educational programme Ernazarova Madina Aynullaevna, chief specialist of the department of strategic development and quality management.

Self-assessment of an educational master's programme carried out on the basis of the order of the rector No. 31 dated January 28, 2021 "On approval of the composition of the self-assessment committee."

Under the leadership of those responsible for writing reports in the context of standards, working groups for writing reports have been formed in accordance with the criteria of the relevant standards

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffs, educational resources have been analyzed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with the Accreditation Standards for Postgraduate Education Programmes (Master's Degree Programmes) of medical educational institutions (hereinafter referred to as text - accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of the strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications from 16 tables, are not presented in sufficient volume, not in order of sequence, but there are references to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

# 2.4 General assessment of the master's study programme 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile directions for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes of magistracy of medical educational organizations.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guidelines, at the same time, based on the results of the expert evaluation, recommendations for adjustments were made, which were taken into account by the working group.

The report is written consistently in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text, but do not have continuous and sequential numbering. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations, educational documents, website pages <u>www.qmu.kz...</u>

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. All standards show actual practice of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" for the preparation of undergraduates according to the educational programme of the magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction. In self-assessment report description fairly completed and updated in terms of the number of undergraduates, teachers, administration, information about the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the nine accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and prospects for the development of these master's degree programmes.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited master's degree programme of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

# **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work on the assessment of educational Master's programmes 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with programmes and schedule approved on 04/19/2021. Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector Dosmagambetova R.S....

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with undergraduates, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural divisions, teachers, questioning teachers and undergraduates, review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards, studying 69 atChebical and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The staff of the Karaganda Medical University NJSC ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

No.	Full name	Position
1	Dosmagambetova Raushan	Chairperson of the Board
	Sultanovna	
2	Turmukhambetova Anar	Vice-rector for strategic development and science
	Akylbekovna	
3	Ricklefs Victor Petrovich	Vice-rector for Academic Affairs
4	Kosherova Bakhyt Nurgalievna	Vice Rector for Clinical Affairs

5	Toleubekov Kuat	secretary responsible for reception	
	Kuanyshbekovich	Deep of the School of Dharmooy	
6	Loseva Irina Viktorovna	Dean of the School of Pharmacy	
7	Dauletkalieva Zhania Abaevna	Dean of the School of Public health care and	
		Biomedicine	
8	Edilbaeva Tanzira	Dean of the Research School	
	Tokhtarkhanovna		
9	Tashkenbaeva Venera	Dean of the School of Residency and Professional	
	Bazarbekovna	Development	
10	Vlasova Lenina Mikhailovna	6B07201 "Technology of pharmaceutical	
		production	
11	Kayupova Gaukhar Serikovna	7M10108 "Management in public health care"	
12	Edilbaeva Tanzira	8D10100 "Medicine"	
	Tokhtarkhanovna		
15	Turdunova Gulmira Sansyzbaevna	7R01101 "Obstetrics and gynecology, including	
		children's"	
16	Sheveleva Nailya Igorevna	7R01129 "Physical medicine and rehabilitation"	
17	Abugalieva Tleuzhan Orazalievna	7R01124 "Family Medicine"	
18	Elena Kravtsiv	Head of Human Resources Management	
		Department	
19	Kultenov Marat Tulegenovich	Head of Student Service Center	
21	Amirova Yana Olegovna	Director of the Library and Publishing Center	
22	Kasatova Aida Magatovna	Director of the Department of Academic Work	
23	Kemelova Gulshat Seitmuratovna	Director of the Center for Simulation and	
		Educational Technologies	
24	Turgunov Ermek Meiramovich	Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases,	
		MD	
25	Omarkulov Bauyrzhan	Director of IPH&PH, Candidate of Medical	
	Kadenovich	Sciences, Associate Professor	
26	Kamyshansky Evgeny	Pathologist of the KMU, PhD	
	Konstantinovich		
27	Medeshova Aigul Turdykhankyzy	Associate Professor at the School of Pharmacy	
28	Kalishev Marat Guzairovich	Professor at the School of Public health care and	
		Biomedicine.	
29	Mugazov Miras Mugazovich	Assistant at the Department of Emergency	
		Medicine, Anesthesiology and Reanimatology	
30	Zhusupova Ayman Maksutovna	Associate Professor of the Department of Internal	
		Medicine	

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the annex to this report.

The first day of the visit is 05/12/2021. An interview with the management and key employees of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8,9, namely, to identify approaches in developing the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and the place of postgraduate education in the profile direction in the strategy of the university (plan), mechanisms in determining the educational programmes of the magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction, and qualified teachers, guaranteeing the

adequacy of educational resources through planning public procurements and concluding agreements with country and international partners.

The experts studied in detail the documentation, including journals of progress and attendance (paper and electronic in Platonus), working curricula, syllables, control and measuring instruments, examination sheets.

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SCES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for educational and scientific activities, reporting, etc.) ...

The basis for effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" and developed at the departments of the magistracy "Department Policies", as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines in the implementation of documenting the educational process.

The conversation with the vice-rectors for educational and scientific activities, as well as for strategic development allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting staff for teaching undergraduates, on the strategy and tactics of recruiting undergraduates, information security of undergraduates, ensuring the implementation of research and development by undergraduates, the choice of research topics, the approval procedure, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most practicing doctors do not know the methodology teaching.

Interview with the executive secretary of the university Toleubekov K.K. on the formation of a set of applicants for a specialized master's degree, monitoring of the employment of graduates, satisfaction with the quality of training of graduates. A very meaningful conversation took place with the head of the EP Kayupova G.S. about the content of the EP of the accredited programme.

The day ended with interviewing undergraduates and doctoral students. It should be noted that during the interview there were 2 undergraduates and more than 20 doctoral students, that is, more than half of all students, which confirms the great interest and patriotism of students, commitment to their university. The interviewees were happy to inform the experts that they entered the specialized master's programme purposefully, and that the master's degree will give them the opportunity to climb the career ladder.

### The second day of the visit is 05/13/2021.

This day was devoted to visiting the training bases of undergraduates and doctoral students. We visited the university's own medical clinic, in particular the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, got acquainted with the structure of the clinical base, study rooms of students. Head Department of Amirbekov Zh.T. and assistant of the department Turdunova G.S. answered all questions in great detail and provided supporting material, demonstrating 100% knowledge of all the work of the department. We also participated in the online testing of undergraduates in the EP "Management in Public health care". Master student Dastan Sh.M. presented her master's thesis.

A group of experts visited the School of Public health care and Biomedicine, where the programme manager Kayupova G.S. showed the entire educational and methodological complex for the EP "Management in Public health care".

NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" has a sufficient number of clinical bases, where undergraduates carry out their practical work and collect materials for the preparation of a master's thesis. The programme of the visit announced a visit to 4 clinical bases, according to which the university staff prepared video reviews and organized online connection of undergraduates. In the course of interviews with undergraduates, experts established compliance with standard 6 and student satisfaction with scientific leadership (standard 2.5) and advisory support from the university.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

On the same day, a meeting took place with heads and employees of structural divisions involved in the implementation of EP on *Standards 6.8, as well as interview* with teachers, undergraduates and doctoral students, employers (representatives of practical health care).

The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of teachers' certificates in teaching methods. On the same day, experts studied the materials on the selection of teachers, the personnel policy of the university.

In order to validate the fulfillment of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews with undergraduates were conducted. Attended 2undergraduate student. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at the university, the adequacy of time for training, work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers. In general, undergraduates are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, since they believe that the university has excellent bases and experience in teaching undergraduates. The undergraduates unanimously spoke about the help from the teaching staff on any issues regarding the topics of master's theses, design, preparation of material, etc. Especially prompt help and more modern literature and interactive teaching methods in the analysis of complex cases. Undergraduates believe that they will receive a good education and will be able to work independently after graduating from the university.

The undergraduates showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research and development, funding, etc.). The experts studied the documents of undergraduates (portfolio, assessment results - checklists, results of a questionnaire survey of undergraduates).

Interview with over 10 employers for the Master's degree programmes declared for accreditation were conducted online and included such issues as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the MUK advisory bodies, satisfaction with basic knowledge and skills of undergraduates, participation in training undergraduates through mentoring, providing the department and undergraduates with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of graduates of the magistracy, etc.

A review of resources showed that the university has modern, equipped lecture and practical classrooms with interactive whiteboards, projectors, computers with round-the-clock Internet. The training base corresponds the goals and objectives of accredited educational programmes on modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff ensure collegial and ethical relations with the leadership to achieve the final results of the educational programme.

Before the start of the discipline, according to the curriculum of the educational programme, the master student receives a syllabus and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies.

The experience and authority of the MUK in teaching undergraduates shows a high percentage of employment (100%) of graduates of other graduate programmes and their demand by medical organizations in all regions of Kazakhstan.

Also, a questionnaire survey of students and teaching staff was carried out, which made it possible to supplement the knowledge of experts on the ongoing educational programme. At the end of the working day, the experts examined the documentation required as supporting documents for self-report.

#### The third day of the visit 05/14/2021

The final day of the experts' work was devoted to a visit to the Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies. The experts noted that this Center is indeed very advanced, they have dummies for all thematic classes. Feedback from students and monitoring of progress have been set at a high level. The Instagram network annually hosts a competition for the "Best Teacher" of the simulation center. The progress of all students is processed by a statistical method with the

determination of the discrimination index and the correlation coefficient, which makes it possible to conduct a deep analysis of the students' progress and identify weaknesses in mastering the learning material.

On this day, experts studied the documentation for educational programmes. The experts studied the documentation of the dean's office of the School of Public health care and Biomedicine, which confirmed the compliance with the accreditation standards (Regulation on the School, nomenclature of school affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for 2020-2021 academic year and report for 2020, progress journal undergraduates, feedback questionnaires with undergraduates, teachers, reports on the results of the questionnaire and the measures taken, the code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), including documentation (69 requests) at the request of EEC members.

The experts' work was devoted to interviewing the compliance officer of the university. Urmashev U.A. He spoke in a meaningful way about the implementation of the university's anti-corruption policy, monitoring corruption risks, and maintaining academic integrity among employees and students. According to him, there were cases at the university when a student tried to sell tests through a social network, but this was false information on the part of this student, because the university is included in the League of Academic Integrity and 98% of exams are in the form of a written exam. The student was expelled from the university because of this misconduct.

Further, the experts engaged in the development of recommendations, the final discussion of the results of the external specialized assessment of the MUK for compliance with accreditation standards, filling out the quality profile and evaluation criteria for compliance with the ECAQA accreditation standards individually by each member of the EEC. Discussion of recommendations for improving the educational process in the MUK. The conclusion of the commission's work was the final vote on each recommendation of all standards for flour.

I, the chairperson of the EEC, Ermukhanova L. S., summarized the data of the members of the EEC and, together with experts, formed a draft of the final report of the EEC with recommendations for improving the university (18 in total). Then the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external assessment within the framework of accreditation of educational programs of master's, doctoral and residency specialties.

#### **Results of the survey.**

An observer from the ECAQA in 05/12/14/05/2021 conducted an online survey of undergraduates and teachers of NJSC "MUK" on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com/</u>...

# **Results of the survey of students:**

A total of 48 students participated in the survey, including 10 residents of the 1st year of study, 15 of the 2nd years of study, 8 residents of 3-4 years of study, 2 undergraduate students, 1 undergraduate students, and 12 doctoral students. the number of responding undergraduates - 1, which is 2.08% of the surveyed students. Will recommend this university as an educational organization - 87.5% fully agree, partially - 12.5%.

Programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to learning fully agree - 89.58%, partially agree - 10.42%.

Office equipment is available for students in classrooms and practice bases completely agree - 95.83%, partially - 4.17%. Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, 97.92% of respondents fully agree and partially agree - 2.08%. 95.83% of respondents note that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work, and 4.17% partially agree with this statement. 95.83% of the respondents agree that the teachers and staff of the MUK respect students, and 4.17% note partial agreement.

Fully (95.83%) agree that the organization has and is implementing social programmes to support students. 85.42% of the respondents say that there is a student career counseling service in the educational organization, but at the same time 8.33% of the respondents have not heard of such an organization, and 6.25% doubt the answer.

91.67 %% of the respondents (in full), and 8.33% (in part) believe that the methods of assessing knowledge and skills are fair. Fully 91.67% and partially 8.33% of respondents believe that the educational programme meets expectations. 95.83% of the respondents believe that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods, and 4.17 think that sometimes. 100% of the respondents say that teachers are never late for classes and always give feedback after completing classes. Fully 91.67% and partially 8.33% of the respondents like to study in this educational organization. 97.92% of respondents claim that they have never experienced a negative attitude from teachers.

When asked whether the heads or teachers of the university were involved in the preparation for accreditation, 75% answered "yes" when preparing the self-assessment report. 8.33% answered that they were involved at all stages of preparation for accreditation, and 4.17 answered "negative".

#### **Results of the survey of teachers:**

The total number of teachers on the list is 27. The total number of respondents is 27, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 3.7%, up to 10 years - 7.41%, over 10 years - 88.89%. Management in health care facilities, master's degree was attended by 11.11%, medicine, doctoral studies - 18.52%, residency -37.04% and bachelor's degree in pharmacy / TPP - 14.81%.

74.07% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process, and 22.22% are partially satisfied. At the university, ethics and subordination are observed in full agreement 92.59%, in part - 25.93%. 74.07% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace, partially 7.7%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and the development of competence for teachers - 92.59% fully agree, partially - 3.7%.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research work - 81.48% fully agree. Salary suits 51.85% of the surveyed teaching staff. 74.07% of the respondents were fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 14.81% were partially satisfied. The majority of those surveyed have undergone advanced training for the last 5 years. Only 85.19% fully agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 7.41% - partially. When asked whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events, 33.33% answered positively, 11.11% answered that the university does not pay any expenses, and 25.93% do not turn to the management on this issue. 62.96% of respondents answered that the university implements programmes of social support for teachers

Management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 51.85%, sometimes - 25.93% of respondents, 3.7% answered never. In teaching, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often problem-oriented - 62.96%, interactive teaching - 55.56%, oral analysis of a topic - 51.85%, lectures - 48.15%, analysis of situational tasks - 74.07%, cases are compiled and solved - 40.74%. Fully 62.96% agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of your organization's activities 25.93%.

The results of the survey are presented in the Attachment and, in general, demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of training in undergraduate, graduate, doctoral, and residency programmes, and at the same time identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, teaching staff salaries, availability of management and administration for teachers, pedagogical competence and professional development of teachers).

#### Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of accredited Master's degree programmes. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme of NJSC "MUK" was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure that the information provided by the MUK and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards was valid.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, the MUK described its best practice on adherence to accreditation standards, during the external expert evaluation, the EEC members studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan, syllables, control and measuring instruments, checklists, master's portfolio, individual plans of undergraduates for the 2020-2021 academic year, publications of teachers, admission rules, personnel policy, an internal quality assurance system programme, resources (classrooms, office equipment available for undergraduates to work with literature, educational and methodological literature), which made it possible to identify compliance activities of the educational organization to the basic accreditation standards.

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for the training of medical personnel in the magistracy were taken into account (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KP DSM-16).

The volume of the study load for the sections of the accredited educational programmes is determined by the individual work plan of the master's student for one year and monitored by the monthly reports of the master's student. The accounting of completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

New edition of order No. 647 On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.<u>No. KR</u> <u>DSM-12/2020</u> reflected in the accredited EP.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme for the current state educational standard is being implemented during the 1st (profile direction), at this time 3 master's students are being graduated, there is all the educational, methodological, personnel and resource base and they are assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (meetings of departments), the assessment of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of student bases, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and assessment of undergraduates, the development of meaningful parts of individual plans of undergraduates.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the Master's degree programme 7M10108 "Management in Public health care", the profile direction for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on May 14, 2021.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the MUK team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the master's degree programmes in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of accredited educational programmes was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for the education of undergraduates of the MUK schools, departments, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external assessment of master's degree programmes 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile directions and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

Purpose and mission of the educational programme 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile directions fully comply with the mission and goals of NJSC "MUK", the Charter of the organization of education, reflect the main areas of activity.

The standard clearly spells out the expected competencies of graduates of the scientific and pedagogical and specialized magistracy, differences in the acquired competencies in the learning process are visible.

The school "Public health care and Biomedicine", responsible for the master's programme, applies a variety of innovations in the learning process, allowing to develop the basic and special competences of undergraduates, namely, solving situational problems, decision-making.

Experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of an educational programme in terms of the elective component, the policy of assessing the current and final assessment, including the choice of methods (testing, oral questioning, exam), selection and admission of undergraduates (specialty exam), personnel policy in relation to teachers for accredited educational programmes, as well as the allocation of resources (classroom fund of bases in accordance with agreements).

At the same time, the participation of practical health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme, and in particular the proposals made to change and supplement the mission, are not sufficiently reflected.

Overall, Standard 1 demonstrates compliance.

### Strengths:

1. Strengths: NJSC "MUK" has institutional autonomy for the development and implementation of policies, especially with regard to the development of educational programmes and the use of dedicated resources for its implementation.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 5 standards conform: completely - 0, significantly - 4, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

# Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

Bring the final learning outcomes into line with the code of the educational programme.

# **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROCESS**

Accredited educational programmes of magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile directions are implemented in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Standard Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.No. KR DSM-12/2020 within 2 years and during this period a lot of work has been done on the development of educational and methodological materials, the organization of the place of training for undergraduates, the formation of the composition of departments and the determination of the heads of master's theses. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development and approval of the Master's programme has been determined

The staff of the department has the necessary competencies for training. The teachers of the departments use a variety of methods of active (business games, brainstorming, case studies, etc.) and traditional (oral analysis, mini-lectures) training, according to which staff members are periodically trained within the university, in other organizations (NCIE, Nazarbayev University, NAO, etc.). The Department of Postgraduate Education is monitoring this process.

There are no precedents of inequality, lack of ethics or other violations of a gender, cultural or religious nature in the process of external evaluation.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied

Thus, the educational programme of the magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care" the profile area demonstrates the integration between teaching and research.

#### Strengths:

1... The educational programme is described in accordance with the regulatory legal acts in the field of education and health care (references to the regulatory legal acts are indicated). The structure of the EP corresponds, according to pr. 647, pr. 152. The proportion of general education, specialized and elective disciplines is observed, according to the State Educational Standard of Education.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 21 standards conform: completely - 6, significantly - 14, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

# Standard 2: completed

# Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

Revise the profile disciplines in the programme, according to the code of the educational programme.

#### Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING

The MUK has developed and implemented an assessment policy for undergraduates, which includes the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the "Academic Policy". Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of undergraduates is borne by the teaching staff of the departments, heads of departments (modules), the office of the registrar.

The assessment of the academic achievements of undergraduates covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by the school - control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options for correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is posted in the Academic Policy.

As an additional method for evaluating undergraduates, the portfolio is used, which the experts got acquainted with at the Department of Public health care and Biomedicine. Undergraduates are engaged in research work, which must necessarily end with the publication of a scientific article or a report at scientific and practical conferences, the defense of a master's project, in the case of a specialized master's degree and the defense of a master's thesis in the case of a scientific and pedagogical magistracy.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2015, 2020. for educational programmes of magistracy. The results of educational achievements of students are entered into an electronic educational journal through the programme "Platonus" and "Session".

The possibility of an appeal based on the results of the intermediate and final certification of undergraduates is determined in the internal document "Academic policy for the 2020-2021 academic year."

Planning procedure, organization, monitoring and analysis of assessment methods in the HSE ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring instruments is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in the assessment of knowledge in the magistracy, then it is introduced at the department.

Thus, this standard is being implemented at the university.

#### **Strengths:**

1. Due to the fact that the university is included in the league of Academic Integrity, 98% of exams are passed in the form of a written exam.

2. The electronic database "Platonus" has been introduced, with a proctoring system, which provides transparency and speed of recording the results of the assessment of undergraduates.

3. A portfolio of undergraduates has been introduced, which allows you to assess the development of additional competencies of a undergraduate.

*Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.* Out of 10 standards conform: completely - 7, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** None.

# **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

According to the mission of NJSC "MUK", the training of competitive specialists for health care "is the main activity of the university, and the admission policy is aimed at selecting the best candidates for the master's degree.

The policy and criteria for admission to the magistracy of NJSC "MUK" are regulated in accordance with the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The formation of the contingent of the University's master's programme is carried out in accordance with the state order for the training of specialists with postgraduate medical education. The selection and admission policy are fully consistent with the current legislation and the Charter of NJSC "MUK". The number of admitted undergraduates is planned taking into account the total area of classrooms, the availability of the teaching staff, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of the university's practical bases, the availability of social and living conditions for the training of undergraduates. Information about the beginning of the selection committee is available to everyone on the university website.

The number of enrolled students in NJSC "MUK" at the EP of the magistracy 7M10108 "Management in public health care"

Academic	Language of instruc	ction	Form of financing		Total:
year	state	Russian	state order economic contra		
				(target)	
2019-2020	-	9	-	9	9
2020-2021	1	2	-	3	3

NJSC "MUK" provides assistance and support to the activities of undergraduates, including the provision of technical and financial support. Master students are provided with a working area with office furniture, cleaning and maintenance, access to wireless Internet, a library, and medical care. Conditions for the residence of undergraduates have been created. The effectiveness and efficiency of support services is carried out through reports, internal audits, performance assessment and consideration of issues at meetings of collegial governing bodies - a meeting of schools, the Senate and the Academic Council of the University

But at the same time, none of the undergraduates during the interviews confirmed their participation in various bodies or at least in working groups in order to improve the quality of the educational process.

# Strengths:

1. High commitment and continuity of students to this university.

2. Great career opportunities.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 12 standards conform: fully - 11, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

# Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

None.

#### **Standard 5: STAFFING**

The activities of the teaching staff and employees are carried out in accordance with the internal labor regulations and job descriptions approved by the Rector of the University. The selection and placement of scientific and pedagogical personnel is carried out by concluding labor contracts in accordance with the rules of the current legislation.

The qualification level of the teaching staff corresponds to the positions held. There are personal files with information about the employee, certificates of compliance with the required specialty and the level of scientific training in the relevant field of knowledge.

The number of teaching staff teaching disciplines within the framework of the Management in Health care programme for 2021 is 10 people, with a ratio of 4: 1 working full-time and part-time, respectively, the average age is 47.4 years, 100% of the total staff for this programme has scientific degree.

The administration of NJSC "MUK" determines for each category of employees and implements a selection policy corresponding to the mission of the programme. The qualifications of teachers are confirmed by the appropriate academic degree, academic title, experience, professional experience and the trust of colleagues, and monitoring of the responsibilities of teachers in all disciplines of the educational programme is ensured. The qualifications and potential of teachers correspond to the direction of the educational programme being implemented and the level of their positions. The university provides moral and material support for distinguished teaching staff.

Thus, this standard is being implemented at the university.

#### Strengths:

1. The qualifications and potential of teachers correspond to the direction

the educational programme being implemented and the level of their positions held.

2. The procedure for encouraging employees is determined by the provisions "On the system of remuneration and motivation of employees of the University."

3. Highly qualified and authoritative teaching staff implementing the educational programme at NJSC "MUK"

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 7 standards: completely - 7, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

# Standard 5: completed

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** None.

# Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP

The learning environment, including the necessary material, technical and information resources, meets the objectives of the educational programme. For the efficient operation of the infrastructure, modernization of the software and hardware is being carried out. Computers of educational corps have access to the Internet with a bandwidth of channels to access the Internet from 100 Mbit / s and internal information exchange with a speed of up to 535 Mbit / s;

Students and teachers of the department have the opportunity of free and free access to the Internet, through wireless points of access (Wi-Fi) from any computer in all study computers. Access to Internet resources is provided in computer rooms and lecture rooms equipped with interactive docks and other multimedia technology and reading rooms.

The book fund corresponds to the profile of preparation.

The library and publishing center has 2 information kiosks, with the help of which users can make an electronic order of the necessary literature on the electronic catalog based on the "WEB-IRBIS" module.

Users are informed by mailing to corporate Outlook mail, as well as posting information on the MUK website, the MUK Portal and the MUK Student Portal.

The MUK website has a section "Library" in Kazakh, English and Russian languages, at <u>http://www.qmu.kz/ru</u>...

In addition, undergraduates are trained in methods of registering and searching for relevant scientific full-text literature in the Research Gate system – free social network and a means of collaboration between scientists from all scientific disciplines. The material and technical characteristics and potential of the university are a guarantee of its sustainability. In accordance with the Mission, goals and objectives, KMU "KSPH" LLP annually conducts an analysis and a set of measures to improve the state of the material and technical base, as well as a number of actions to improve and introduce new trends in educational services based on information technologies.

The university library is provided with 98.5% of electronic resources and access to such resources as: Cochrane Library, Web of Science, Scopus, Science Direct and others.

All this confirms the fact of compliance with this standard....

# Strengths:

1. The provision of disciplines of the specialty with educational literature on digital media is 100%. 2.Updated material and technical base.

3. In NJSC "MUK" there is a student service center (SSC), where undergraduates as students can receive various types of certificates, admissions for working out missed classes and much more centrally.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 4, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit** None.

### Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS

NJSC "MUK" has a programme for monitoring educational activities, processes and learning outcomes, including the routine collection of data on key aspects of the educational programme. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process, to identify areas requiring intervention. To assess the educational programme. Quality assessment mechanisms educational activities and training of students for the educational programme of the master's programme is determined within the framework of the systems of internal and external assessment. NJSC "MUK" guarantees the quality of training of students in the implementation of the master's programme on the basis of the standard, including through: monitoring, periodic review of educational programmes; development of objective procedures for assessing the level of knowledge and skills-students, graduates' competencies; objectivity can be ensured through the implementation of mechanismsmultilateral assessment of the quality of training by the university and employers; ensuring the competence of the teaching staff through integration with scientific institutions, high-tech companies and employers. The mechanisms of interaction with employers to guarantee the quality of training under the Master's programme are the participation of representatives of potential employers in the assessment of the quality of training of graduates in the framework of the state final certification External assessment of the quality of educational activities under the master's programme within the framework of the state accreditation procedure is carried out in order to confirm the compliance of educational activities with the requirements of the state standard, taking into account the corresponding educational programme. To implement the procedures for monitoring progress and intermediate certification of students, the university creates assessment materials that allow assessing the achievement of the results of its development planned in the master's programme and the level of formation of all competencies

# Strengths:

1. The standard clearly defines the forms of teaching EP classes.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 8 standards conform: completely -0, significantly

 - 8, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0
Standard 7: completed
Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: None.

#### **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

General management of the educational process and general control of all aspects of the implementation of accredited Master's degree programmes at the university level is carried out by the School of Public health care and Biomedicine. Appointed responsible for the EP "Management in Public health care" - GS Kayupova.

The university administration and teachers are responsible for the quality of the educational programme

Academic and programme leaders are suitably qualified as doctors of medical sciences. The university has administrative staff responsible for planning and implementation.

KMU "KSPH" has a clear range of responsibilities and authorities to provide the educational programme with resources, including the target budget for training.

The university has the autonomy to allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational programme.

The stable financial position of the university allows annually to allocate significant funds to improve the material and technical base. the financial position of the academy allows significant funds to be allocated annually to

Strengths:

- 1. Flexible and dynamic management and administration system.
- 2. Close and effective communication with key stakeholders (graduates, employers).

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 19 standards conform: fully - 16, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

# Standard 8: completed

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:* Absent...

# **Standard 9: CONTINIOUS RENEWAL**

Updating the educational programme of disciplines is carried out taking into account the needs of employers and the labor market, as well as in accordance with new regulations.

When developing and changing the educational programme with the participation of associations and employers, they are annually considered at an expanded meeting of the department, taking into account the interests of employers, adjustments are made to the EP and the content of the taught disciplines. Updating the EP is systematic, taking into account the interests of employers. The conditions for the effective promotion of a student along an individual educational trajectory in order to develop individual characteristics, needs and cultural experience of students meet all the requirements for the implementation of the EP.

In NJSC "MUK" monitoring, performance evaluation, revision of the policy in the field of quality assurance of EP based on information management are carried out, depending on the requirements of the labor market and the environment. The implementation of the educational programme is based on the maintenance and development of the principles of academic integrity.

The process of constant renewal is carried out through the introduction of innovations and the use of information technologies, problem-oriented learning, the development of assessment methods, the organization of education based on competencies, the expansion of academic mobility, the revision of personnel policy, the improvement of the efficiency of operational processes and the transparency of the decision-making process. The curriculum is assessed and approved, analyzing the degree to which teaching and research methods are in line with European requirements and the requirements of the national health system.

Monitoring of the application of the educational programme is carried out on the basis of the results obtained: academic performance, feedback on the basis of the questionnaire conducted, protocols of departments, reporting of divisions.

Constant renewal and improvement of all types of activities of NJSC "MUK" is based on regular and thorough study of models and trends of development and innovations in medical education in different countries. This is achieved by studying specialized literature, inviting international experts, applying the experience and skills acquired during the academic mobility of students, teachers and administration representatives in leading centers and medical universities in the world. Leaders of educational programmes, all interested persons have the opportunity to participate in conferences, seminars and trainings dedicated to the development of medical education, self-assessment and accreditation processes at the programme and institutional levels, quality Assurance in Higher Education.

Overall, Standard 9 demonstrates compliance with the requirements for accredited programmes.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Conforms out of 4 standards: fully - 2, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 9: completed

# **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** None.

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, there were no inconsistencies in the implementation of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards during the analysis of the self-assessment report and the examination within the framework of the tasks of the external expert assessment programme.

6. Recommendations for improving the master's educational programme 7M10108 "Management in public health care" profile direction of NJSC "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA":

# **Standard 1. MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

1. Bring the final learning outcomes in accordance with the code of the educational programme.

# **Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROCESS**

2.Revise the profile disciplines in the programme, according to the code of the educational programme.

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme 7M10108 "MANAGEMENT IN PUBLIC HEALTH CARE" PROFILE DIRECTION OF THE NJSC "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA" for a period of 5 years.

# Chaiperson

Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna Foreign expert Sulaeva Oksana Nikolaevna Academic expert Urazova Saltanat Nurguzhaevna Academic expert Kurmanova Almagul Medeubayevna Academic expert Zhakypbekov Kairat Saparkhanovich Representative of practical health care Vitt Svetlana Vladimirovna **Resident Representative** Shaikhina dinara Student Representative Iskakova Saltanat Mukhtarovna ECAQA Observer Umarova Makpal Aldibekova

# Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) Of the educational programme of magistracy 7M10108 "Management in Public health care" profile direction of NJSC "MUK"

		Assessment			
Standard	Criteria for evaluation		X. S	mpliant	atch
	Number of standards = BS * / SU	Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	-	4	1	-
	5 = 5/0				
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROCESS 21 = 19/2	6	14	1	-
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING 10 = 10/0	7	3	-	-
4.	<b>STUDENTS 12 = 12/0</b>	11	1	-	-
5.	STAFFING 7 = 7/0	7	-	-	-
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP 4 = 4/0	4	-	-	-
7.	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS 8 = 8/0	-	8	-	-
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION 19 = 19/0	16	3	-	-
9.	<b>CONTINUOUS RENEWAL 4 = 4/0</b>	2	2	-	-
	Total: 90 = 88/2	53	35	2	-
		90			

\* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfillment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

# Attachment 2.

No.	Names of documents	number	Date of approval (if applicable)
1.	Regulations on the Senate of NJSC "MUK"	1	10/22/2019
2.	Regulations on remuneration of NJSC "MUK"	1	01/22/2020
3.	Regulations on the student support service of NJSC "MUK"	1	07/08/2019
4.	Regulations on student self-government of NJSC "MUK"	1	07/08/2019
5.	Regulations on the performance management system for employees of NJSC "MUK"	1	-
6.	School regulations	1	11/01/2021
7.	Regulations on the organization of inclusive education in NJSC "MUK"	1	09.12.2020
8.	Regulations on the assessment of the activities of the divisions of NJSC "MUK"	1	09.09.2020
9.	Rules for the competitive filling of vacant positions of heads of structural divisions, heads of departments, teaching staff, researchers and employees of the internal audit service	1	26.08.2019
10.	Syllabuses.	1	09/01/2020
11.	EP consideration protocols from the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines and Chemistry.	1	03/26/2019.
12.	Mission Review Protocols	1	09/23/2018
13.	EP "Management in Public health care"	1	04/25/2019
14.	Extract No. 8 from the School Council.	1	04/09/2019
15.	Extract from the Academic Council	1	04/25/2019
16.	Safety logs.	1	-
17.	Journals to familiarize students with academic policy.	1	-
18.	Methodical recommendations for innovative methods.	1	11/16/2020
19.	Agreements with bases of practice of undergraduates	3	-